

**Operation, maintenance *and*  
sustainability of services**  
*for the urban poor*



# **Operation, maintenance *and* sustainability of services for the urban poor**

**Findings, lessons learned and case studies  
summary and analysis**

*M. Sohail, S. Cavill & A.P. Cotton*

*with assistance from  
N. Ahmad, S. Mehmood, H.M.U. Chularathna & N.A. Wato*



Water, Engineering and Development Centre  
Loughborough University  
2001



Water, Engineering and Development Centre  
Loughborough University  
Leicestershire  
LE11 3TU UK

© WEDC, Loughborough University, 2001

Any part of this publication, including the illustrations (except items taken from other publications where the authors do not hold copyright) may be copied, reproduced or adapted to meet local needs, without permission from the author/s or publisher, provided the parts reproduced are distributed free, or at cost and not for commercial ends, and the source is fully acknowledged as given below. Please send copies of any materials in which text or illustrations have been used to WEDC Publications at the address given above.

A reference copy of this publication is also available online from:  
<http://www.lboro.ac.uk/wedc/publications/omssup.htm>

Sohail, M., Cavill, S. and Cotton, A.P. (2001)  
*Operation, Maintenance and Sustainability of Services for the Urban Poor:  
Findings, lessons learned and case studies summary and analysis*  
WEDC, Loughborough University, UK.

ISBN Paperback 0 906055 95 4

This document is an output from a project funded by the UK  
Department for International Development (DFID)  
for the benefit of low-income countries.  
The views expressed are not necessarily those of DFID.

Designed and produced at WEDC

Printed by Q3, Loughborough

## **Acknowledgements**

The authors gratefully acknowledge the many people who have willingly contributed their knowledge, opinion and time to the development of this work.

In particular we wish to thank Mr Michael Mutter, DFID; Professor Nabeel Hamdi, Oxford Brookes University; Ms Sue Phillips and Dr Ann Condy, Social Development Direct; Mr K A Jayaratne, Mr Kumara and Mr H M U Chularathna, Sevanathe, Colombo, Sri Lanka; Mr N A Wattoo, Anjuman-E-Samaji Behbood; Ms Perveen Rehman, Orangi Pilot Project; Mr Noman Ahmed, NED University of Engineering and Technology, Karachi; Professor Arif Hassan, Urban Resources Centre, Karachi; Mr Shahid Mehmood, Community Action Programme, Faisalabad, Pakistan; Centre for Youth and Social Development, Bhubaneswar; Ms Barbara Evans, Water and Sanitation Programme; and WEDC members of staff.

*Special thanks to the people from the low-income settlements of case study locations who have contributed to the research and provided their perspectives on the issue. We are greatly indebted to them.*

# Contents

## **PART A**

### **Section A1**

|                             |          |
|-----------------------------|----------|
| Introduction                | <b>3</b> |
| Purpose of this study       | 3        |
| Why we are doing this work  | 3        |
| Focus of the project        | 4        |
| What we have done so far    | 4        |
| What this report is about   | 4        |
| Who should read this report | 6        |
| Where to find out more      | 6        |

### **Section A2**

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| Background to operation and maintenance | <b>7</b> |
| Municipal level                         | 8        |
| Community/NGO level                     | 8        |

### **Section A3**

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| Setting operation and maintenance issues<br>within the sustainable livelihood approach | <b>9</b> |
| Community participation  | 10       |
| Summary of the case study success in O&M   | 12       |
| Technical sustainability   | 12       |
| Institutional sustainability   | 14       |
| Financial sustainability   | 15       |
| Lessons learned related to the procurement of services                                 | 16       |
| Procurement at the municipal level   | 16       |
| Community procurement  | 17       |
| Lessons learned related to technical sustainability                                    | 22       |
| Lessons learned related to institutional sustainability                                | 28       |
| Lessons learned related to financial sustainability                                    | 36       |
| Emerging themes  | 41       |

## **PART B**

### **Section B1**

|                      |           |
|----------------------|-----------|
| Introduction         | <b>49</b> |
| Purpose              | 49        |
| Case study summaries | 49        |

### **Section B2**

|                        |           |
|------------------------|-----------|
| Case studies summaries | <b>51</b> |
| Sri Lanka              | 51        |
| Karachi                | 75        |
| Faisalabad             | 93        |
| Cuttack                | 110       |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Section B3</b>   |            |
| Analysis of the case studies  | <b>159</b> |
| Technical sustainability  | 159        |
| Did the services provided respond to community needs, in general and in terms of their technical specifications?          | 159        |
| Sri Lanka   | 159        |
| Karachi   | 161        |
| Faisalabad  | 162        |
| Cuttack   | 163        |
| What level of technical expertise was required for different levels of O&M?   | 165        |
| Sri Lanka   | 165        |
| Karachi   | 165        |
| Faisalabad  | 166        |
| Cuttack   | 166        |
| Were the necessary skills and resources available to carry out the O&M by the various parties responsible?                | 168        |
| Sri Lanka   | 168        |
| Karachi   | 169        |
| Cuttack   | 169        |
| Faisalabad  | 170        |
| Institutional sustainability  | <b>172</b> |
| At what stages were communities involved in service provision (from identification through to monitoring and evaluation)? | 172        |
| Sri Lanka   | 172        |
| Karachi   | 173        |
| Faisalabad  | 174        |
| Cuttack   | 176        |
| What structures and mechanisms were in place that promoted greater or lesser community participation?                     | 177        |
| Sri Lanka   | 177        |
| Karachi   | 177        |
| Faisalabad  | 177        |
| Cuttack   | 178        |
| What methods and tools were used to encourage greater participation?  | 179        |
| Sri Lanka   | 179        |
| Karachi   | 179        |
| Faisalabad  | 180        |
| Cuttack   | 180        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| What were the roles and responsibilities of key stakeholders in O&M?   | 181        |
| Sri Lanka  | 181        |
| Karachi  | 182        |
| Faisalabad   | 183        |
| Cuttack  | 184        |
| How clearly were roles and responsibilities defined?   | 185        |
| Sri Lanka  | 185        |
| Karachi  | 185        |
| Faisalabad   | 186        |
| Cuttack  | 186        |
| <b>Financial sustainability</b>  | <b>188</b> |
| What policies/practice were established on cost recovery or cost sharing with communities for the services as a whole and O&M in particular? | 188        |
| Sri Lanka  | 188        |
| Karachi  | 191        |
| Faisalabad   | 192        |
| Cuttack  | 193        |
| Were communities consulted on these policies, and in relation to the choice of technical options?  | 195        |
| Sri Lanka  | 195        |
| Karachi  | 195        |
| Faisalabad   | 195        |
| Cuttack  | 195        |
| What mechanisms were put in place for costs to be recovered? (What incentives to pay and penalties for non payment?)                         | 196        |
| Sri Lanka  | 196        |
| Karachi  | 196        |
| Faisalabad   | 196        |
| Cuttack  | 197        |
| What factors affected willingness to pay?  | 197        |
| <b>Appendix</b>  |            |
| Picture captions   | 198        |
| Photographs  | 199        |



## List of acronyms

|        |   |
|--------|---|
| ASB    | Anjuman Samaji Behbood                      |
| ADP    | Annual Development Plan                     |
| CAP    | Common Action Planning                      |
| CBOs   | Community-Based Organisation                |
| CDA    | Cuttack Development Authority               |
| CDCs   | Community Development Councils              |
| CkMC   | Cuttack Municipal Corporation               |
| CMC    | Colombo Municipal Council                   |
| CMG    | Community Management Group                  |
| CSPU   | Clean Settlement Programme Unit             |
| CUSIP  | Cuttack Urban Services Improvement Project  |
| DFID   | Department for International Development    |
| DMC    | District Municipal Corporation              |
| DMMC   | Dehiwala Mt. Lavinia Municipal Council      |
| FAUP   | Faisalabad Area Upgrading Project           |
| FDA    | Faisalabad Development Authority            |
| FMC    | Faisalabad Municipal Corporation            |
| KDA    | Karachi Development Authority               |
| KMC    | Karachi Metropolitan Corporation            |
| KWSB   | Karachi Water and Sewerage Board            |
| MNA    | Member of National Assembly                 |
| MoU    | Memoranda of Understanding                  |
| MPA    | Member of Provincial Assembly               |
| NGOs   | Non-Government Organisations                |
| NHDA   | National Housing Development Authority      |
| NWS&DB | National Water, Sewerage and Drainage Board |
| OPP    | Orangi Pilot Project                        |
| PALM   | Participatory Analysis and Learning Method  |
| PHED   | Public Health Engineering Department        |
| PMU    | Project Management Unit                     |
| REEL   | Real Estate Exchange Limited                |
| SIP    | Slum Improvement Project                    |
| SKAA   | Sindh Katchi Abadi Authrotiy                |
| SSIP   | Slums and Shanty Improvement Programme      |
| ULA    | Urban Local Authority                       |
| Unicef | United Nations Children's Fund              |
| UPO    | Urban Poverty Office                        |
| VGP    | Vulnerable Group Programme                  |
| WASA   | Water and Sewerage Authority                |
| WSC    | Water Supply Committee                      |

## **List of tables**

|             |   |
|-------------|---|
| Table A3.1  | Systematic approach to maintenance                          |
| Table A3.2  | Means of fundraising  |
| Table A3.3  | Summary of sources of funds                                 |
| Table B2.1  | Distribution of under-served settlements in Colombo by type |
| Table B2.2  | Study of settlements in Colombo, Sri Lanka                  |
| Table B2.3  | Summary of community profile in Colombo, Sri Lanka          |
| Table B2.4  | Salient features of urban services in Kirulapura            |
| Table B2.5  | Salient features of urban services in Bluemendhal Flats     |
| Table B2.6  | Salient features of urban services in Garden No. 211        |
| Table B2.7  | Salient features of urban services in Bo-sevana             |
| Table B2.8  | Salient features of urban services in Govipolawatta         |
| Table B2.9  | Urban infrastructure and services in Kirulapura             |
| Table B2.10 | Urban infrastructure and services in Bluemendhal Flats      |
| Table B2.11 | Urban infrastructure and services in Kalingamawatha         |
| Table B2.12 | Urban infrastructure and services in Garden No. 211         |
| Table B2.13 | Urban infrastructure and services in Bo-sevana              |
| Table B2.14 | Urban infrastructure and services in Govipilawatta          |
| Table B2.15 | Study settlements in Karachi, Pakistan                      |
| Table B2.16 | Water supply infrastructure laying and management           |
| Table B2.17 | Bilal Colony  |
| Table B2.18 | Shah Rasool Colony  |
| Table B2.19 | Singhu Lane - Lyrai Karachi                                 |
| Table B2.20 | Mansoor Nagar   |
| Table B2.21 | Metroville 111  |
| Table B2.22 | Karim Baksh Para  |
| Table B2.23 | Mujahid Colony  |
| Table B2.24 | Welfare Colony  |
| Table B2.25 | Talib Colony Central  |
| Table B2.26 | Talib Colony West   |
| Table B2.27 | Infrastructure and services in Faisalabad                   |
| Table B2.28 | Perception of stakeholders                                  |
| Table B2.29 | Key event in Dhuddiwala                                     |
| Table B2.30 | Number of households  |
| Table B2.31 | Approximate cost for services                               |
| Table B2.32 | Key features of Hasanpura                                   |
| Table B2.33 | Cost of infrastructure                                      |
| Table B2.34 | Perceptions of key organisations                            |
| Table B2.35 | Some other projects   |
| Table B2.36 | O&M of services   |

|             |   |
|-------------|---|
| Table B2.37 | Intervention and outcome  |
| Table B2.38 | Organisational context of urban infrastructure and services project |
| Table B2.39 | Infrastructure asset  |
| Table B2.40 | CkMC – available human resources                                    |
| Table B2.41 | Example of initiatives in settlements                               |
| Table B2.42 | Example of no response from the municipalities                      |
| Table B2.43 | Kadam Rasool  |
| Table B2.44 | Operation and maintenance in Patapol Slum                           |
| Table B2.45 | Operation and maintenance in Chhatra Bazar                          |
| Table B2.46 | Operation and maintenance in Khannagar Slum                         |
| Table B2.47 | Operation and maintenance in Mudradakhan Patna and Samadhi Slum     |
| Table B2.48 | Community perceptions in Kadam Rassol                               |
| Table B2.49 | Community perceptions in Pattapol Slum                              |
| Table B2.50 | Community perceptions in Chhatra Bazar                              |
| Table B2.51 | Community perceptions in Khannagar                                  |
| Table B2.52 | Community perceptions in Mudradakhan Patna and Samadhi Slum         |
| Table B3.1  | Operation and maintenance and necessary skills in Colombo           |
| Table B3.2  | Operation and maintenance and necessary skills in Karachi           |
| Table B3.3  | Operation and maintenance and necessary skills in Cuttack           |
| Table B3.4  | Operation and maintenance and necessary skills in Faisalabad        |
| Table B3.5  | Sri Lanka – stages of community involvement                         |
| Table B3.6  | Karachi – stages of community involvement                           |
| Table B3.7  | Faisalabad – stages of community involvement                        |
| Table B3.8  | Cuttack – stages of community involvement                           |
| Table B3.9  | Sri Lanka roles and responsibilities                                |
| Table B3.10 | Karachi roles and responsibilities                                  |
| Table B3.11 | Faisalabad roles and responsibilities                               |
| Table B3.12 | Cuttack roles and responsibilities                                  |
| Table B3.13 | Sri Lanka cost recovery and/or sharing                              |
| Table B3.14 | Karachi cost recovery and/or sharing                                |
| Table B3.15 | Faisalabad cost recovery and/or sharing                             |
| Table B3.16 | Cuttack cost recovery and/or sharing                                |

## **List of photographs**

1. An example of a manhole blocked by the dumping of solid waste.
2. The result of inappropriately designed waste bins.
3. The view of a sewage holding tank before it is pumped to the treatment works.
4. A further illustration of the effects of inadequate O&M on environmental sanitation: children playing in standing sewage.
5. An instance of damage to pipes leading to sewage mixing with drinking water.
6. Partially treated sewage is released into the Lyrar River.
7. The missing covers of water valve-boxes.
8. The disrepair of the road reveals water and sewerage lines running into each other.
9. Lack of water supply means the settlement's main water tank stands empty.
10. A meeting of area representatives.
11. Water vendors illegally pumping water from the municipal tank.
12. The pipe system of a (sewage treatment) works.
13. An example of how inadequate operation and maintenance affects the environmental health of residents in low-income settlements.
14. The view of a settlement from a CBO's office.
15. An example of sewage leaking from faulty household sewerage connections.